

CLOSED, STANDARD

**United States District Court
Eastern District of Pennsylvania (Philadelphia)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 2:16-cv-05632-ER**

THE WOLK LAW FIRM v. UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD
Assigned to: HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO
related Case: 2:19-cv-01401-ER
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 10/27/2016
Date Terminated: 04/09/2019
Jury Demand: Plaintiff
Nature of Suit: 895 Other Statutes:
Freedom of Information Act
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff

THE WOLK LAW FIRM
also known as
ARTHUR ALAN WOLK ASSOCIATES

represented by **MICHAEL S. MISKA**
THE WOLK LAW FIRM
1710-12 LOCUST STREET
PHILADELPHIA, PA 19103
215-545-4220
Email: mmiska@airlaw.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CYNTHIA MARIE DEVERS
THE WOLK LAW FIRM
1710-12 LOCUST ST
PHILADELPHIA, PA 19103
215-545-4220
Email: cdevers@airlaw.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

DON GOLDSTEIN

represented by **CYNTHIA MARIE DEVERS**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MICHAEL S. MISKA
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

INGRID GOLDSTEIN
INDIVIDUALLY AND AS
CO-ADMINISTRATORS OF THE
ESTATE OF MARK GOLDSTEIN,
DECEASED

represented by **CYNTHIA MARIE DEVERS**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MICHAEL S. MISKA
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION
SAFETY BOARD

represented by **MARGARET L. HUTCHINSON**
U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE
615 CHESTNUT STREET
SUITE 1250
PHILADELPHIA, PA 19106
215-861-8282
Fax: 215-861-8618
TERMINATED: 08/29/2018
LEAD ATTORNEY

STACEY L.B. SMITH
 U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE
 615 CHESTNUT ST., STE 1250
 PHILADELPHIA, PA 19106
 215-861-8348
 Email: stacey.smith@usdoj.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

VERONICA JANE FINKELSTEIN
 U.S. ATTORNEYS OFFICE EDPA
 615 CHESTNUT ST STE 1250
 PHILADELPHIA, PA 19106
 215-861-8598
 Email: veronica.finkelstein@usdoj.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
10/27/2016	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD (Filing fee \$ 400 receipt number 149229.), filed by THE WOLK LAW FIRM, DON GOLDSTEIN, INGRID GOLDSTEIN . (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Civil Cover Sheet, # <u>2</u> Case Management Track Form, # <u>3</u> Designation Form)(rt) (Entered: 10/28/2016)
10/27/2016		Summons Issued as to UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD. Two Forwarded To: Counsel and One Given to AUSA on October 28, 2016 (rt) (Entered: 10/28/2016)
10/31/2016	<u>2</u>	Acceptance of Service by U.S. Attorney Re: accepted summons and complaint on behalf of the United States Attorney (only). (va,) (Entered: 11/01/2016)
11/03/2016	<u>3</u>	PRAECIPE for Alias Summonses by DON GOLDSTEIN, INGRID GOLDSTEIN, THE WOLK LAW FIRM. (MISKA, MICHAEL) Modified on 11/4/2016 (md). (Entered: 11/03/2016)
11/15/2016		3 Alias Summonses Issued as to UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD: 2 given to Counsel's Courier on 11/8/16; and 1 additional summons given to Counsel's Courier on 11/15/16, per Counsel's Request for US Attorney's Office in Washington, DC. (va,) Modified on 11/17/2016 (md). (Entered: 11/17/2016)
11/16/2016	<u>4</u>	MOTION to Dismiss <i>Plaintiffs' Complaint</i> filed by UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD.Memorandum, Certificate of Service.(SMITH, STACEY) (Entered: 11/16/2016)
11/21/2016	<u>5</u>	NOTICE: A pretrial conference will be held on December 22, 2016 at 2:00 p.m. in Courtroom 15A before the HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO. (nds) (Entered: 11/21/2016)
11/21/2016	<u>6</u>	ORDER THAT A HEARING TO CONSIDER DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO DISMISS <u>4</u> WILL BE HELD ON DECEMBER 22, 2016 AT 2:00 P.M. IN COURTROOM 15A BEFORE THE HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 11/21/2016. 11/21/2016 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED.(nds) (Entered: 11/21/2016)
11/28/2016	<u>7</u>	AFFIDAVIT of Service by Michael S. Miska re: served Civil Action Complaint upon U.S. Atty, Civil-Process Clerk by USPS, Certified Mail on 11/22/16 (MISKA, MICHAEL) (Entered: 11/28/2016)
11/28/2016	<u>8</u>	AFFIDAVIT of Service by Michael S. Miska re: served Civil Action Complaint upon Loretta Lynch, Esq. US Atty General by USPS, Certified Mail on 11/15/16 (MISKA, MICHAEL) (Entered: 11/28/2016)
11/30/2016	<u>9</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>4</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>Plaintiffs' Complaint w/Memorandum of Law and Certificate of Service</i> filed by DON GOLDSTEIN, INGRID GOLDSTEIN, THE WOLK LAW FIRM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B, # <u>4</u> Exhibit C, # <u>5</u> Exhibit D, # <u>6</u> Exhibit

		E, # <u>7</u> Exhibit F, # <u>8</u> Exhibit G, # <u>9</u> Exhibit H, # <u>10</u> Exhibit I, # <u>11</u> Exhibit J, # <u>12</u> Exhibit K, # <u>13</u> Exhibit L, # <u>14</u> Exhibit M, # <u>15</u> Exhibit N, # <u>16</u> Exhibit O, # <u>17</u> Exhibit P, # <u>18</u> Exhibit Q)(MISKA, MICHAEL) (Entered: 11/30/2016)
12/16/2016	<u>10</u>	STATUS REPORT (<i>JOINT</i>) PURSUANT TO RULE 26(f) by DON GOLDSTEIN, INGRID GOLDSTEIN, THE WOLK LAW FIRM. (MISKA, MICHAEL) (Entered: 12/16/2016)
12/20/2016	<u>11</u>	ORDER THAT A HEARING TO CONSIDER DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO DISMISS [ECF #4] SCHEDULED ON 12/22/16 AT 2:00 PM IS RESCHEDULED FOR 1/12/17 AT 3:00 PM BEFORE THE HON. EDUARDO C. ROBRENO IN COURTROOM 15A, U.S. COURTHOUSE, 601 MARKET ST., PHILA., PA. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 12/20/16. 12/20/16 ENTERED & E-MAILED.(fdc) (Entered: 12/20/2016)
12/22/2016	<u>12</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by CYNTHIA MARIE DEVERS on behalf of DON GOLDSTEIN, INGRID GOLDSTEIN, THE WOLK LAW FIRM with Certificate of Service(DEVERS, CYNTHIA) (Entered: 12/22/2016)
12/22/2016	<u>13</u>	MOTION to Amend/Correct <u>1</u> Complaint, filed by DON GOLDSTEIN, INGRID GOLDSTEIN, THE WOLK LAW FIRM.Motion to Amend Complaint w/Memo of Law In Support, Certificate of Service, Proposed Order. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, Part 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, Part 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit A, Part 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit A, Part 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit A, Part 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit A, Part 6)(MISKA, MICHAEL) (Entered: 12/22/2016)
01/13/2017	<u>14</u>	Minute Entry for proceedings held before HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO. Motion Hearing held on 1/12/17 re <u>4</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>Plaintiffs' Complaint</i> filed by UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD (va,) (Entered: 01/13/2017)
01/13/2017	<u>15</u>	ORDER THAT PLAINTIFFS' UNOPPOSED MOTION TO AMEND <u>13</u> IS GRANTED. DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO DISMISS <u>4</u> IS DENIED AS MOOT. DEFENDANT'S ORAL MOTION TO DISMISS COUNT ONE OF THE AMENDED COMPLAINT IS GRANTED. DEFENDANT SHALL FILE BY FEBRUARY 1, 2017 A MOTION TO DISMISS COUNT TWO OF THE AMENDED COMPLAINT AND/OR A MOTION TO STAY. PLAINTIFFS SHALL FILE A RESPONSE TO ANY MOTION BY FEBRUARY 21, 2017. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 01/13/2017.01/13/2017 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED.(nds) (Entered: 01/13/2017)
01/17/2017	<u>16</u>	AMENDED COMPLAINT – CIVIL ACTION FOR INJUNCTIVE RELIEF against UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD, filed by THE WOLK LAW FIRM, DON GOLDSTEIN, INGRID GOLDSTEIN. Certificate of Service. Exhibits. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Part 2, # <u>2</u> Part 3, # <u>3</u> Part 4, # <u>4</u> Part 5, # <u>5</u> Part 6) (va,) (Entered: 01/18/2017)
01/27/2017	<u>17</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer <i>Defendant's Unopposed Motion for Extension of Time</i> filed by UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD.Certificate of Service.(SMITH, STACEY) (Entered: 01/27/2017)
01/30/2017	<u>18</u>	ORDER THAT THE MOTION FOR EXTENSION OF TIME TO FILE AN ANSWER <u>17</u> IS HEREBY GRANTED AND DEFENDANTS SHALL HAVE UNTIL FEBRUARY 8, 2017 TO MOVE TO DISMISS/STAY, ETC. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 01/30/2017.01/30/2017 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED.(nds) (Entered: 01/30/2017)
02/08/2017	<u>19</u>	MOTION to Stay filed by UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD.Memorandum, Certificate of Service, Declaration. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit exhibit 1 Declaration, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Exhibit 2 to 13, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Exhibit 14 to 24)(SMITH, STACEY) (FILED IN ERROR – REFILED BY ATTY AS PAPER NO. <u>20</u>) (va,). (Entered: 02/08/2017)
02/08/2017	<u>20</u>	Amended MOTION to Stay re <u>16</u> Amended Complaint, filed by UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD.Memorandum, Certificate of Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit – Declaration, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 to 13, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 14 to 24)(SMITH, STACEY) (Entered: 02/08/2017)

02/21/2017	<u>21</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>20</u> Amended MOTION to Stay re <u>16</u> Amended Complaint, filed by DON GOLDSTEIN, INGRID GOLDSTEIN, THE WOLK LAW FIRM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 13, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 14, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 15, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 16, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 17, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 18, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 19, # <u>20</u> Exhibit 20, # <u>21</u> Exhibit 21, # <u>22</u> Exhibit 22, # <u>23</u> Exhibit 23, # <u>24</u> Exhibit 24, # <u>25</u> Exhibit 25, # <u>26</u> Exhibit 26, # <u>27</u> Exhibit 27, # <u>28</u> Exhibit 28, # <u>29</u> Exhibit 29, # <u>30</u> Exhibit 30, # <u>31</u> Exhibit 31, # <u>32</u> Exhibit 32, # <u>33</u> Exhibit 33, # <u>34</u> Exhibit 34, # <u>35</u> Exhibit 35, # <u>36</u> Exhibit 36, # <u>37</u> Exhibit 37, # <u>38</u> Exhibit 38, # <u>39</u> Exhibit 39, # <u>40</u> Exhibit 40)(MISKA, MICHAEL) (Entered: 02/21/2017)
03/08/2017	<u>22</u>	TRANSCRIPT of HEARING held on 1/12/17, before Judge EDUARDO C. ROBRENO. Court Reporter/Transcriber MARY SCARDUZIO. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER.. Redaction Request due 3/29/2017. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 4/10/2017. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 6/6/2017. (jaa,) (Entered: 03/09/2017)
03/08/2017	<u>23</u>	Notice of Filing of Official Transcript with Certificate of Service re <u>22</u> Transcript – PDF, 3/9/17 Entered and Copies Emailed and Mailed.. (jaa,) (Entered: 03/09/2017)
04/13/2017	<u>24</u>	ORDER THAT UPON REVIEW OF DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO STAY <u>20</u> THE COURT WILL HOLD A STATUS AND SCHEDULING CONFERENCE ON MAY 15, 2017 AT 10:00 A.M. IN COURTROOM 15A. FURTHER, BY MAY 5, 2017, DEFENDANT SHALL SHOW CAUSE WHY PLAINTIFFS' FOIA REQUESTS CANNOT BE FULFILLED IN FULL BY THE DATES SOUGHT BY PLAINTIFF, ETC. SIGNED BY THE HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 04/12/2017. 04/13/2017 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED.(nds) (Entered: 04/13/2017)
05/05/2017	<u>25</u>	RESPONSE TO ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE by UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD. (SMITH, STACEY) (Entered: 05/05/2017)
05/12/2017	<u>26</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>20</u> Amended MOTION to Stay re <u>16</u> Amended Complaint, filed by DON GOLDSTEIN, INGRID GOLDSTEIN, THE WOLK LAW FIRM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 41, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 42, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 43, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 44)(MISKA, MICHAEL) (Entered: 05/12/2017)
05/15/2017	<u>27</u>	Minute Entry for proceedings held before HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO. Status Conference held on 5/15/17. Court Reporter: ESR. (va,) (Entered: 05/16/2017)
05/18/2017	<u>28</u>	ORDER THAT DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR STAY <u>20</u> IS DENIED, ETC. A STATUS CONFERENCE WILL BE HELD ON SEPTEMBER 12, 2017 AT 10:00 A.M. IN COURTROOM 15A BEFORE THE HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 05/18/2017. 05/18/2017 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED.(nds) (Entered: 05/18/2017)
05/18/2017		***A status conference is set for 9/12/2017 at 10:00 a.m. HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO. ***(nds) (Entered: 05/18/2017)
07/07/2017	<u>29</u>	MOTION to Amend/Correct <i>Complaint</i> filed by DON GOLDSTEIN, INGRID GOLDSTEIN, THE WOLK LAW FIRM.Motion, Memorandum, Certificate of Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Part 1 of 6, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A – Part 2 of 6, # <u>3</u> Exhibit A – Part 3 of 6, # <u>4</u> Exhibit A – Part 4 of 6, # <u>5</u> Exhibit A – Part 5 of 6, # <u>6</u> Exhibit A – Part 6 of 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit B, # <u>8</u> Exhibit C, # <u>9</u> Exhibit D, # <u>10</u> Exhibit E, # <u>11</u> Exhibit F)(MISKA, MICHAEL) (Entered: 07/07/2017)
07/21/2017	<u>30</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>29</u> MOTION to Amend/Correct <i>Complaint</i> filed by UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD. (SMITH, STACEY) (Entered: 07/21/2017)
08/10/2017	<u>31</u>	STATUS REPORT by DON GOLDSTEIN, INGRID GOLDSTEIN, THE WOLK LAW FIRM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A (Goldstein), # <u>2</u> Exhibit B (Becker), # <u>3</u> Exhibit C (Williams – Young), # <u>4</u> Exhibit D (Malcolm – Basel), # <u>5</u> Exhibit E (Lallo), # <u>6</u> Exhibit F (Quinn))(DEVERS, CYNTHIA) (Entered: 08/10/2017)

08/21/2017	<u>32</u>	STATUS REPORT by UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Service, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A)(SMITH, STACEY) (Entered: 08/21/2017)
08/30/2017	<u>33</u>	STATUS REPORT <i>Plaintiffs' Supplemental Status Report</i> by DON GOLDSTEIN, INGRID GOLDSTEIN, THE WOLK LAW FIRM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit G)(MISKA, MICHAEL) (Entered: 08/30/2017)
09/12/2017	<u>34</u>	ORDER THAT THE DEFENDANT SHALL FILE A MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT BY OCTOBER 27, 2017, ETC. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 09/12/2017. 09/12/2017 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED.(nds) (Entered: 09/12/2017)
09/12/2017	<u>35</u>	Minute Entry for proceedings held before HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO. Status Conference held on 9/12/17. Court Reporter: ESR. (va,) (Entered: 09/13/2017)
10/27/2017	<u>36</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD.Memorandum, Certificate of Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 13)(SMITH, STACEY) (Entered: 10/27/2017)
10/27/2017	<u>37</u>	TRANSCRIPT of STATUS CONFERENCE held on 9/12/17, before Judge ER. Court Reporter/Transcriber ESR. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. TK Transcribers. Redaction Request due 11/17/2017. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 11/27/2017. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 1/25/2018. (va,) (Entered: 10/30/2017)
10/27/2017	<u>38</u>	Notice of Filing of Official Transcript with Certificate of Service re <u>37</u> Transcript – PDF, 10/30/17 Entered and Copies Emailed. (va,) (Entered: 10/30/2017)
11/27/2017	<u>39</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>36</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by DON GOLDSTEIN, INGRID GOLDSTEIN, THE WOLK LAW FIRM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum Memorandum of Law, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order Proposed Order, # <u>3</u> Certificate of Service Certificate of Service, # <u>4</u> Exhibit A, # <u>5</u> Exhibit B, # <u>6</u> Exhibit C)(MISKA, MICHAEL) (Entered: 11/27/2017)
12/05/2017	<u>40</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by VERONICA JANE FINKELSTEIN on behalf of UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD with Certificate of Service(FINKELSTEIN, VERONICA) (Entered: 12/05/2017)
12/05/2017	<u>41</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>a Reply Brief in support of its</i> <u>36</u> <i>Motion for Summary Judgment</i> filed by UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD.Certificate of Counsel, Certificate of Service.(FINKELSTEIN, VERONICA) (Entered: 12/05/2017)
12/05/2017	<u>42</u>	ORDER THAT DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR AN EXTENSION OF TIME <u>41</u> IS GRANTED, ETC. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 12/5/2017. 12/5/2017 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED.(nds) (Entered: 12/05/2017)
12/05/2017		Set/Reset Deadlines as to <u>36</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . REPLIES DUE BY 1/8/2018. (md) (Entered: 12/06/2017)
01/08/2018	<u>43</u>	RESPONSE in Support re <u>36</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD. (SMITH, STACEY) (Entered: 01/08/2018)
02/09/2018	<u>44</u>	MOTION for Leave to File <i>SurReply ISO Pltfs. Opposition</i> filed by DON GOLDSTEIN, INGRID GOLDSTEIN, THE WOLK LAW FIRM.Plths. Motion for Leave to file SurReply. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1)(MISKA, MICHAEL) (Entered: 02/09/2018)
05/07/2018	<u>45</u>	***VACATED*** ORDER THAT DEFENDANT SHALL SUBMIT TO THE COURT, FOR IN CAMERA REVIEW, A HARD COPY OF EACH RESPONSIVE DOCUMENT THAT DEFENDANT HAS WITHELD FROM PRODUCTION BY

		MAY 10, 2018, ETC. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 5/3/18. 5/7/18 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED.(rv) Modified on 5/10/2018 (nds). (Entered: 05/07/2018)
05/10/2018	<u>46</u>	ORDER PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO AMEND COMPLAINT <u>29</u> IS DENIED WITHOUT PREJUDICE. DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT <u>36</u> IS DENIED WITHOUT PREJUICE. PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR FILE A SUR-REPLY <u>44</u> IS DENIED WITHOUT PREJUDICE. THE PARTIES MAY FILE MOTIONS FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT BY MAY 30 2018. THE COURT'S ORDER OF MAY 7, 2018 <u>45</u> IS VACATED, ETC. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 05/10/2018. 05/10/2018 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED.(nds) (Entered: 05/10/2018)
05/17/2018	<u>47</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>an Amended Motion for Summary Judgment</i> filed by UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD.Memorandum, Certificate of Service.(SMITH, STACEY) (Entered: 05/17/2018)
05/23/2018	<u>48</u>	ORDER THAT DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR EXTENSION OF TIME <u>47</u> IS GRANTED. THE PARTIES SHALL HAVE UNTIL JUNE 15, 2018 TO FILE MOTIONS FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT, ETC. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 05/22/2018. 05/23/2018 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED.(nds) Modified on 5/24/2018 (md). (Entered: 05/23/2018)
06/18/2018	<u>49</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER THAT DEFENDANT, UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD SHALL HAVE UNTIL JUNE 29, 2018 TO FILE MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT, ETC. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 06/18/2018. 06/18/2018 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED.(nds) (Entered: 06/18/2018)
06/29/2018	<u>50</u>	Amended MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD.Memorandum in Support of Amended Motion, Certificate of Service, Table of Exhibits. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3)(SMITH, STACEY) (Entered: 06/29/2018)
07/02/2018	<u>51</u>	Amended MOTION for Summary Judgment (<i>CORRECTED</i>) filed by UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD.Memorandum, Certificate of Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Certificate of Service)(SMITH, STACEY) (Entered: 07/02/2018)
07/13/2018	<u>52</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>51</u> Amended MOTION for Summary Judgment (<i>CORRECTED</i>), <u>50</u> Amended MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by DON GOLDSTEIN, INGRID GOLDSTEIN, THE WOLK LAW FIRM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Brief, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>3</u> Certificate of Service, # <u>4</u> Exhibit A, # <u>5</u> Exhibit B, # <u>6</u> Exhibit C, # <u>7</u> Exhibit D)(MISKA, MICHAEL) (Entered: 07/13/2018)
08/29/2018	<u>53</u>	NOTICE of Withdrawal of Appearance by MARGARET L. HUTCHINSON on behalf of UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD(va,) (Entered: 09/06/2018)
04/04/2019	<u>54</u>	ORDER THAT A TELEPHONE STATUS AND SCHEDULING CONFERENCE WILL BE HELD ON APRIL 9, 2019 AT 10:00 A.M., ETC. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 04/03/2019. 04/04/2019 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED.(nds) Modified on 4/5/2019 (md). (Entered: 04/04/2019)
04/09/2019	<u>55</u>	MEMORANDUM AND/OR OPINION. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 04/09/2019. 04/09/2019 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED.(nds) (Entered: 04/09/2019)
04/09/2019	<u>56</u>	ORDER THAT DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT <u>51</u> IS GRANTED. PLAINTIFFS' PRAYER FOR RELIEF IN COUNT II OF THE AMENDED COMPLAINT <u>16</u> IS GRANTED IN PART, ETC. PLAINTIFF'S AMENDED COMPLAINT <u>16</u> IS DISMISSED WITH PREJUDICE. THE CLERK OF COURT SHALL MARK THIS CASE CLOSED. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 04/09/2019. 04/09/2019 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED.(nds) (Entered: 04/09/2019)

04/09/2019	<u>57</u>	JUDGMENT IS HEREBY ENTERED IN FAVOR OF DEFENDANT AND AGAINST PLAINTIFF, ETC. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 04/09/2019. 04/09/2019 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED.(nds) (Entered: 04/09/2019)
04/10/2019	<u>58</u>	Minute Entry for proceedings held before HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO Telephone Status Conference held on 4/9/19. (ti,) (Entered: 04/11/2019)